



Board Report

File #: 2022-0652, **File Type:** Informational Report

Agenda Number: 23.

CONSTRUCTION COMMITTEE October 20, 2022

**SUBJECT: OFFICE OF THE INSPECTOR GENERAL
CHANGE ORDER CONSTRUCTION SPOT CHECKS**

ACTION: RECEIVE AND FILE

RECOMMENDATION

RECEIVE AND FILE Office of the Inspector General Change Order Construction Spot Check Report for the period June 1 to August 31, 2022.

ISSUE

On January 25, 2018, the Metro Board directed the Office of the Inspector General (“OIG”) to conduct random spot checks on change orders for the projects listed in the quarterly program management report to ensure that the CEO Delegation of Authority to approve Construction Change Orders Policy is performing in the manner desired by the Board of Directors.

BACKGROUND

The OIG’s Construction Change Order Spot Check Program (“Spot Checks”) focuses on approved change orders and modifications that exceed \$500,000. The four change orders in this report were selected from the Program Management Quarterly Major Project Status, Legistar 2022-0668. The OIG gathers the data, reviews all the change orders over \$500,000 and selects change orders from the major projects. The information for the Spot Checks was collected from the Program Management Information System (PMIS) which is the department’s database system. Also, TEAM meetings and telephonic interviews were conducted with Metro Program Management, Project Control, and Procurement staff from each involved project office.

For each Spot Check we summarize:

- Description of the change order,
- Change order detail,
- Scope of Work,
- Budget,
- Schedule (Time to execute the change order),
- Safety, and
- Recommendations (lessons learned are identified starting with this report).

Metro’s Program Control department has provided informal responses to this report before its

issuance and are asked to provide written responses to the recommendations in this OIG Spot Checks Report within 30 days after this Report is issued. Included with this Report is a spreadsheet on the status of responses concerning former OIG Spot Check Report recommendations.

DISCUSSION

Spot Checks Performed in this Quarter

Spot Check #1 - Regional Connector Transit Corridor Project -

This OIG Spot Check report concerns the Regional Connector Transit Corridor Project - (Contract C0980 MOD-0239), Additional AT&T Duct bank Installations at 2nd Street - Construction.

Change Order Detail

See Attachment A Spot Check #1 chart.

Summary #1

Scope of Work - This change order (MOD 0239) is to extend the work limits beyond the station boundary extending into Broadway and Spring Streets and construct new AT&T duct banks. In 2014, AT&T developed engineering plans, which were approved by City of Los Angeles, for the 2nd and Broadway Streets Station, under the Regional Connector contract. In 2020, the contractor and Metro determined the communication lines could not be constructed as planned because of numerous conflicting underground utilities and the existing communication vaults that were too small and in poor condition. Plans have now been re-developed to extend the duct bank beyond the station limits and extend into Broadway and Spring Streets. Pothole investigation will occur to determine feasible locations for the new communication vaults on Spring Street north of the Broadway Street intersection. Two communication vaults will be purchased on a separate change order.

Budget - This modification was negotiated, and the award amount is \$4,150,000. The Contractor's proposal was \$5,349,197 and the ICE was \$4,275,427. The difference in price is \$1,199,197 (-22.4%) under the contractor's proposal. The negotiated amount was \$125,427 (-2.9%) under the ICE. Staff stated that funds for this change are within the recently amended Life-of-Project budget.

Schedule - The CEO Delegation of Authority process was utilized for this modification. The Contractor and Metro agreed on the Scope of Work on July 29, 2022. The modification including the price, was awarded on August 17, 2022, and was completed in 14 workdays. Under the prior Board approval method for change orders, assuming a September Board meeting date, it would have taken a total of 39 workdays to complete the transaction.

Safety - Regional Connector has 7,417,605 project hours through June 2022 with a Recordable Injury Rate of 0.73 (Bureau of Labor Statistics the National Average is 2.4) and a Days Away, Restricted or Transferred (DART) of 0.00 (Bureau of Labor Statistics National Average is 1.5).

Recommendation -The OIG acknowledges the unknown underground site condition of numerous conflicting underground utilities, but the existing AT&T communication vaults that were both too small and in poor condition may or may not have been known prior to the beginning of contract. It should be noted that AT&T did not initially provide design or informational requests for new vaults and now Metro is creating a change order to pay the contractor for an oversight on the utility's behalf.

The OIG recommends, as a **Lesson Learned**, during project planning Metro should ask the Utility company to acknowledge that all vaults, duct banks, and utility lines conform to current specifications and are in satisfactory condition. It is prudent for Metro to be aware of the utilities condition before entering into a construction contract.

Spot Check #2 - Division 20 Portal Widening and Turnback Project

This OIG Spot Check report concerns the DIV 20 Portal Widening and Turnback Project (Contract C1136 CO-0017.4/MOD 0037), 1st Street Bridge Continuous Monitoring.

Change Order Detail

See Attachment A Spot Check #2 chart.

Summary #2

Scope of Work - This change order is to provide continuous electronic survey monitoring of all movements of the 1st Street Bridge during major construction impacts. At multiple locations across the bridge, instrumentations were set up to read at set intervals, monitor, and report the bridge movement. Alerts are sent to Metro, City of Los Angeles, Engineer of Record, and the Contractor when movement exceeds set thresholds.

The change order for monitoring movement was first established as CO-0017.0 for \$234,600 in February 2021; it was increased to \$1,131,306 in CO 17.1 and increased again to \$1,831,306 in CO 17.2 and then was superseded by CO 17.3 for \$2,110,000 this amount included all the prior changes. The Contractor submitted a cost and schedule proposal in December 2021 for this work. A final agreement on the scope of work occurred in May 2022 and MOD 37 was created for an agreed upon price of \$3,465,238. The Contractor is refusing to sign the modification (MOD 37) with Metro. Therefore, Metro has issued a unilateral change order (CO 17.4) totaling \$3,465,238; the Contractor is allowed to invoice hours and materials each month until the \$3,465,238 is exhausted. The use of unilateral change orders is not uncommon but Metro has been put in a position to issue a unilateral because the contractor refuses to sign a modification. This sum covers the total charges for the instrumentation and monitoring of the bridge movements (as stated previously). The agreed amount has been projected for work to occur out to June 2023, using the remaining balance of \$1,355,238 (this is the difference between CO 17.3 and CO 17.4) to have continuous monitoring until all bridge construction impacts are complete. This construction and monitoring will be complete when the demolition of the affected portion of the bridge supporting structure is removed.

Budget - Four Not To Exceed ("NTE") change orders plus this final unilateral change order totals \$3,465,238. This modification was negotiated, but the contractor refused to sign the modification and the project office chose to issue a unilateral change order. The Contractor's proposal was \$3,624,429 and the ICE was \$3,114,343. The difference in price is \$159,191 (-4.4%) under the contractor's proposal. The negotiated amount was \$350,895 (11.3%) over the ICE. Staff stated that funds for this change are within the recently amended Life-of-Project budget.

Schedule - The CEO Delegation of Authority process was utilized for this modification. The Contractor and Metro agreed on the Scope of Work on May 27, 2022. The unilateral change order was awarded on July 26, 2022, and was completed in 41 workdays. Under the prior Board approval method for change orders, assuming an August Board meeting date (no July meeting), it would have

taken a total of 63 workdays to complete the transaction.

Safety - DIV 20 Project has 545,997 project hours with a Recordable Injury Rate of 0.73 (Bureau of Labor Statistics the National Average is 2.4) and a Days Away, Restricted or Transferred (DART) of 1.5 (Bureau of Labor Statistics National Average is 1.5).

Recommendation - As was recommended in the prior quarterly construction change orders spot check report, the OIG recommends the issue of liability for sub-contractors claims and bonds be resolved so that it is not necessary to use NTE change order methods, and further change orders follow the standard Metro construction practices and procedures.

Spot Check #3 - Airport Metro Connector Transit Station

This OIG Spot Check report concerns the Airport Metro Connector Transit Station (Contract C1197 MOD 009), Bulletin 16 - Light Rail Transit (LRT) Fence Updates.

Change Order Detail

See Attachment A Spot Check #3 chart.

Summary #3

Scope of Work - This change order (MOD 009) regards changes to the stainless-steel fencing at the Airport Metro Connector station. The contract drawings were revised at Metro's request to increase the capacity of the fence to resist seismic and wind loads by reducing the weight of the fence.

To accomplish this, the width between fence posts and the support assembly were shortened. The footing size and the post depth into the footing was modified. Additionally, the stainless-steel thickness was reduced and a different finish to the surface both lightened the weight. Even though the heaviness of the fence was reduced, the cost increased because of the current raw material shortage escalated the price.

Budget - This modification was negotiated, and the award amount is \$2,319,894. The Contractor's proposal was \$2,858,617 and the ICE was \$2,116,833. The difference in price is \$538,723 (-18.8%) under the contractor's proposal. The negotiated amount was \$203,061 (9.6%) over the ICE. Staff stated that funds for this change are within the Life-of-Project budget.

Schedule - The CEO Delegation of Authority process was utilized for this modification. The Contractor and Metro agreed on the Scope of Work on June 9, 2022. The modification was awarded on August 9, 2022, and completed in 43 workdays. Under the prior Board approval method for change orders, assuming an August Board meeting date, it would have taken a total of 55 workdays to complete the transaction.

Safety - The Airport Metro Connector Transit Station Project has 129,560 project hours with a Recordable Injury Rate of 1.54 (Bureau of Labor Statistics reports the National Average is 2.4) and Days Away, Restricted or Transferred (DART) of 0.00 (Bureau of Labor Statistics reports the National Average is 1.5). Note that this project has not reached 1 million hours and the data can only be properly interpreted after project reaches necessary hours.

Recommendation - The OIG recommends Metro consider updating Metro Rail Design Criteria

(MRDC) and necessary specifications to reflect current 2022 California Seismic standards and future requests for proposals to build better and be prepared for future earthquakes. This may be considered a **Lesson Learned**.

Spot Check #4 - Purple Line Extension Section 1 Transit Project

This OIG Spot Check report concerns the Purple Line Extension Section 1 Transit Project (Stations Contract C1045 MOD 159), Track Level Access Openings at Wilshire/Western, Wilshire/La Brea and Wilshire/ La Cienega.

Change Order Detail

See Attachment A Spot Check #4 chart.

Summary #4

Scope of Work - This modification is to provide three temporary structural openings in the tunnel shaft to provide efficient and safe access for new building materials, removal of tunnel boring machine (TBM) bearings, and cutterheads. Previous access was provided from the Division 20 rail yard through the tunnel using the tracks to Wilshire/Western station. That access will no longer be allowed as construction advances towards completion of the turnback project at the Division 20 rail yard. The three locations at Wilshire and Western (10-ft x 10-ft), Wilshire and La Brea (14-ft x 32-ft), and Wilshire and La Cienega (15-ft x 40-ft) will be designed and constructed by the Contractor. This change order is out of the scope of the contract because of delays associated with the TBM's due to anomalies at Wilshire and San Vicente. These temporary openings in the station exterior walls will mitigate construction delays associated with the roof, concourse, and entrance of the stations.

Budget -. These modifications were negotiated, and the award amount is \$5,487,903. The Contractor's proposal was \$7,147,417 and the ICE was \$5,200,824. The award amount was \$1,659,514 (-23.2%) under the contractor's proposal. The negotiated amount was \$287,079 (5.5%) over the ICE. Staff stated that funds for this change are within the approved amended Life-of-Project budget.

Schedule - The CEO Delegation of Authority process was utilized for this modification. The Contractor and Metro agreed on the Scope of Work on May 27, 2022. The modification was awarded on June 30, 2022, and was completed in 24 workdays. Under the prior Board approval method for change orders, assuming an August Board meeting date, it would have taken a total of 63 workdays to complete the transaction.

Safety - Purple Line Extension 1 Project has 7,316,693 project hours with a Recordable Injury Rate of 1.09 (Bureau of Labor Statistics reports the National Average is 2.4) and Days Away, Restricted or Transferred (DART) of 0.08 (Bureau of Labor Statistics reports the National Average is 1.5).

Recommendation - none.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

This report will have no financial impact on the Agency beyond what is described above.

Impact to Budget

For all of the construction change orders reviewed, Metro states the funds are within the approved budget and will utilize the contingency funds to cover the costs from the LOP budget.

- Spot Check #1) \$4,150,000 Regional Connector Transit Corridor Project
- Spot Check #2) \$3,465,238 DIV 20 Portal Widening & Turnback Project
- Spot Check #3) \$2,319,894 Airport Metro Connector Transit Station
- Spot Check #4) \$5,487,903 Purple Line Extension Section 1 Project

The OIG was informed that the contractor on spot check #2 refuses to sign modifications because the Metro standard modification form says Metro will not pay the sub-contractor's bond cost. Therefore, Metro has decided to issue a unilateral change order to avoid over use of NTE's. The disagreement concerning the modification form language should be resolved.

EQUITY PLATFORM

In the opinion of the OIG, we considered whether these change orders presented any equity related issues on their face. There are a few locations downtown in the Regional Connector project at Alameda and 1st Street in China Town and Division 20 railroad yard that are within or adjacent to Equity Focus Communities (EFC's). There are 20-ft high sound walls around the construction worksites to protect residential communities and office suites from the nuisance of construction noise. The OIG did not receive any data concerning other community impacts. Each of the contractors are striving to have work performed by Disadvantage Business Enterprises (DBE) typically at 12-15% implementation, for these change orders at these EFC sites. The OIG observed no obvious disparate impacts created by these change orders on small businesses, low-income persons, or by the performance of the work in a manner that impacted a disadvantaged community beyond what is typical and usual when conducting any construction.

IMPLEMENTATION OF STRATEGIC PLAN GOALS

The Office of Inspector General reviews large change orders over a calendar quarter and makes recommendations as appropriate to support Metro's Strategic Plan Goal #5: Provide responsive, accountable, and trustworthy governance within the Metro organization and CEO goals to exercise fiscal discipline to ensure financial stability. The OIG mission includes reviewing expenditures for fraud, waste, and abuse in Metro programs, operations, and resources. For each selected change order reviewed, the OIG evaluates whether there are red flags of fraud, waste, or abuse taking place. We report the details of the significant change orders and make recommendations consistent with the OIG's Construction Best Practices report dated February 29, 2016, more particularly focusing on lessons learned, improving efficiencies, and prudent spending.

NEXT STEPS

The OIG shall provide every quarter, an ongoing spreadsheet of recommendations to Program Control and Program Control. Program Control and Program Management agrees to respond to the recommendations of the OIG within 30 days. The OIG continues to meet periodically to discuss reports, recommendations, and the status of implementation of the recommendations with Project

Management, and receive updates. The list of OIG recommendations and Metro management responses is an attachment to this OIG report (Attachment B).

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment A - Change Order Details for Spot Checks

Attachment B - Tracking Sheet of OIG Recommendations and Responses to last quarter

Attachment C - Power Point for October 2022 Construction Spot Checks

Prepared by: Prepared by: Suzanna Sterling, Construction Specialist Investigator, (213) 244-7368

Reviewed by: Karen Gorman, Inspector General, (213) 244-7337


Karen Gorman
Inspector General

Spot Check #1 – Regional Connector Transit Corridor Project - Contract C0980**Change Order Detail**

<u>Description of Modification or Change Order - MOD-0239</u> Additional AT&T Ductbank Installations at 2nd Street – Construction	
<u>Change Order Dates:</u>	
Scope of Work approved	July 29, 2022
Modification Executed	August 17, 2022
<u>Elapsed Time for Executing Change Order:</u>	
Using new delegated process	14 workdays
Estimate using former Board approval process Agenda for the <i>September</i> Board	39 workdays
<u>Cost of Change Order:</u>	
Metro independent cost estimate (ICE)	\$4,275,427
Contractor's proposed cost	\$5,349,197
Negotiated amount	\$4,150,000
Percentage of negotiated amount <i>UNDER</i> ICE	-2.9%
Amount negotiated less than the Contractor's proposal	\$1,199,197

Spot Check #2 - Division 20 Portal Widening Turnback Project - Contract C1136**Change Order Detail**

<u>Description of Modification or Change Order – CO-0017.4 / MOD 0037</u> First Street Bridge Continuous Monitoring	
<u>Change Order Dates:</u>	
Scope of Work approved	May 27, 2022
Unilateral Issued No Modification Executed	July 26, 2022
<u>Elapsed Time for Executing Change Order:</u>	
Using new delegated process,	41 workdays
Estimate using former Board approval process Agenda for the <i>August</i> Board (no July Board)	63 workdays
<u>Cost of Change Order:</u>	
Metro independent cost estimate (ICE)	\$3,114,343
Contractor's proposed cost	\$3,624,429
Negotiated amount	\$3,465,238
Percentage of negotiated amount <i>OVER</i> ICE	11.3%
Amount negotiated less than the Contractor's proposal	\$159,191

Spot Check #3 - Airport Metro Connector Transit Station - Contract C1197**Change Order Detail**

<u>Description of Modification or Change Order – MOD-009</u> Bulletin 16 – Light Rail Transit (LRT) Fence Updates	
<u>Change Order Dates:</u>	
Scope of Work approved	June 9, 2022
Unilateral Executed	August 9, 2022
<u>Elapsed Time for Executing Change Order:</u>	
Using new delegated process	43 workdays
Estimate using former Board approval process Agenda for the <i>August</i> Board (no July Board)	55 workdays
<u>Cost of Change Order:</u>	
Metro independent cost estimate (ICE)	\$2,116,833
Contractor's proposed cost	\$2,858,617
Negotiated amount	\$2,319,894
Percentage of negotiated amount <i>OVER</i> ICE	9.6%
Amount negotiated less than the Contractor's proposal	\$538,723

Spot Check# 4- Purple Line Section 1 Transit Project – Stations Contract C1045**Change Order Detail**

<u>Description of Modification or Change Order – MOD 159</u> Track Level Access Openings at Wilshire/Western, Wilshire/La Brea and Wilshire/ La Cienega	
<u>Change Order Dates:</u>	
Scope of Work approved	May 27, 2022
Not To Exceed amount issued No Modification Executed	June 30, 2022
<u>Elapsed Time for Executing Change Order:</u>	
Using new delegated process	24 workdays
Estimate using former Board approval process Agenda for the <i>August</i> Board (no July Board)	63 workdays
<u>Cost of Modification:</u>	
Metro independent cost estimate (ICE)	\$5,200,824
Contractor's proposed cost	\$7,147,417
Negotiated amount	\$5,487,903
Percentage of negotiated amount <i>OVER</i> ICE	5.5%
Amount negotiated less than the Contractor's proposal	\$1,659,514

ATTACHMENT B (October 2022)

OIG REPORT/ SPOT CHECK # MOD #	RECOMMENDATIONS	MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSES	COMPLETION DATE
October 2022 #1 Contract C0980 MOD-0239 Regional Connector Transit Corridor Project - Additional AT&T Duct bank Installations at 2nd Street – Construction	<p>The OIG acknowledges the unknown underground site condition of numerous conflicting underground utilities, but the existing AT&T communication vaults that were both too small and in poor condition were known prior to the beginning of contract. It should be noted that AT&T did not initially provide design or informational requests for new vaults and now Metro must create a change order and pay the contractor for an oversight on the utility's behalf.</p> <p>The OIG recommends, as a Lesson Learned, that in project planning for Metro to ask the utility company to acknowledgement that all vaults, duct banks, and utility lines conform to current specifications and are in satisfactory condition. It is prudent for Metro to be aware of the utilities condition before entering into a construction contract.</p>		
October 2022 #2 Contract C1136 CO-0017.4/MOD 0037 Division 20 Portal Widening and Turnback Project - 1st Street Bridge Continuous Monitoring	As was recommended in the prior quarterly construction change orders spot check report, the OIG recommends the issue of liability for sub-contractors claims and bonds be resolved so that it is not necessary to use NTE change order methods, and further change orders follow the standard Metro construction practices and procedures.		
October 2022 #3 Contract C1197 MOD-009 Airport Metro Connector Transit Station Bulletin 16 – Light Rail Transit (LRT) Fence Updates	The OIG recommends Metro consider updating Metro's design criteria and necessary specifications to reflect current 2022 California Seismic standards in the MRDC and future requests for proposals to build better and be prepared for future earthquakes. This may be considered a lesson learned.		
October 2022 #4 Contract C1045 MOD 0159 Purple Line Ext. Sect. 1 Track Level Access Openings at Wilshire/Western, Wilshire/La Brea and Wilshire/ La Cienega	None		

ATTACHMENT B (August 2022)

OIG REPORT/ SPOT CHECK # MOD #	RECOMMENDATIONS	MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSES	COMPLETION DATE
August 2022 #1 Contract C1136 MOD-0029 Division 20 Portal Widening and Turnback Project - Time Extension for MOD-20 Addl Scope and Addl Requirements for DIV 20	The OIG recommends, that all future construction contracts include a capped amount per day to pay the contractor when Metro stops critical path construction work or contractor incurs significant delays due to unforeseen causes.	Agreed	
August 2022 #2 Contract C1136 CO-0011.3 Division 20 Portal Widening and Turnback Project - 1st Street Viaduct - Crack and Spall Repair	1) The OIG recommends that the scope of work should be agreed upon as soon as possible. 2) The OIG recommends the issue of liability for sub-contractors claims and bonds be resolved, and further change orders follow the standard Metro construction practices and procedures. We further recommend that the language concerning bonds and sub-contractors in the Metro standard forms for modification/change orders be moved to the Metro standard contract terms and conditions.	Agreed	
August 2022 #3 Contract C1120 CO-0041 Purple Line Ext. Sect. 2 Tunneling Suspension Associated with Abandonment of Oil Wells	The OIG recommends Metro consider implementing Unilateral change orders when the contractor is claiming compensation for delays greater than the contract cap permits.	Agreed	
August 2022 #4 Stations Contract C1152 CO-0035.1 Purple Line Ext. Sect. 3 VA Steam Tunnel Size Increase and Redundancy	Now that the cost schedule proposal (CSP) has been received, the OIG recommends that the Contractor's CSP be thoroughly evaluated to finalize the change order to enter into an agreed upon modification to replace working on a NTE basis as soon as possible.	The Contractor has split the CSP into two parts. Part 1 is the heavy civil work. Part 2 is the Mechanical / Electrical / Plumbing work. Metro has finalized their analysis of Part 1 of the Contractor's CSP of the change and should finalize a value with the contractor imminently. Metro has performed an initial round of fact finding and analysis of Part 2 and is engaging in further meetings with the Contractor to resolve the differences.	

ATTACHMENT B (April 2022)

OIG REPORT/ SPOT CHECK # MOD #	RECOMMENDATIONS	MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSES	COMPLETION DATE
April 2022 #1 Contract C0988 MOD-0551 Crenshaw/LAX Transit Corridor Project Landscape Changes – Park Mesa	none		
April 2022 #2 Contract C0980 MOD-00230 Regional Connector - Transit Corridor Project Alameda Emergency Stair Exit (ES2)	The OIG recommends in-house plan review be as fully completed as possible before Metro groups sign off on the design plans.	The project team agrees with OIG and does have both project staff and Metro staff provide reviews for all plans. This change originated with the change in FLS requirements within the Wye which was identified after award of contract.	
April 2022 #3 Contract C1045 MOD-0144 Purple Line Extension Sect. 1 Construction LaCienega Station During Mining	none		
April 2022 #4 Contract C1045 MOD-0147 Purple Line Extension Sect. 1 Vapor Extraction Street Restoration	none		

ATTACHMENT B (January 2022)

OIG REPORT/ SPOT CHECK # MOD #	RECOMMENDATIONS	MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSES	COMPLETION DATE
January 2022 #1 Contract C0980 MOD-00218 Regional Connector - Transit Corridor Project Metro Eastside Access Improvement Project "Segment 2" Esplanade and other improvements along Alameda Street – Construction Only	none		
January 2022 #2 Contract C1136 CO-00020.2 Division 20 Portal Widening and Turnback Project Differing Site Conditions - Connections to Existing Ductbanks and Unknown Utilities Impacts	The OIG recommends that Metro continue to track the time and materials used by the contractor while negotiating the Contractor's cost and schedule proposal and to bring this change order to a final award amount.	Final award amount for CO-00020.2 has been reached. Negotiations with the Contractor (TPC) consisted of multiple workshops to reach agreement on rates of production, activity duration, labor, materials and equipment required, complexity of the work. Since agreement on these items was challenging, Metro made a business decision to start with the contractor's estimate and deduct items that were not allowed in the contract. A final settlement for CO 20 was reached at \$43.3M, approximately \$10M under the contractor's original estimate. A time delay for changes related to CO 20 in the amount of \$6M, or 6 months at \$1M per month, has also been agreed upon for these changes.	Substantial Completion and commissioning of the turnback track is scheduled for late Fall of 2024 to coincide with Revenue Operations of PLE1. Final project completion could be as much as a year later.
January 2022 #3 Contract C1120 CO-00034 Purple Line Extension Sect. 2 Century City Constellation Station Storm Drain and Sanitary Sewer Relocation Construction of MOD 70 Design	none		
January 2022 #4 Contract C1152 MOD-0007 Purple Line Extension Sect. 3 Replacement Parking at VA Hospital Lot 42 During Station Construction	The OIG recommends that the Contractor be instructed to timely submit cost proposals, enter negotiations, and sign agreements before work is performed so Metro can process the work order close in time to work being performed, not only to pay the contractor but to help ensure the sub-contractors are paid timely.	No Comments	

ATTACHMENT B (October 2021)

OIG REPORT/ SPOT CHECK # MOD #	RECOMMENDATIONS	MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSES	COMPLETION DATE
October 2021 #1 Contract C0980 MOD-00206 Regional Connector - Transit Corridor Project Add Wye Junction Fan Plant - Construction	Since the Board approved of a budget for this item in 2015 at \$12 mil., the cost has increased to a total of \$21,186,000 (a 77% increase). This Fan System cost has been reported in pieces, as parts were completed, but not as a whole to indicate the cost creep overall over time. We recommend that when LOP information is being periodically provided to the Board that it includes a summary, per project, to show historical cost information over the life of each project. That summary should indicate if they anticipate completing the project within the current LOP and how many LOP increases have occurred so far.	The initial board item in 2015 for the fan plant was an ROM at the time and had yet to be fully designed and estimated for a complete change. As the project progressed the design and went into construction, the team worked through the negotiations for the full scope of the fan plant. As of now, there has only been one LOP increase and the project has anticipated that the project would fall within the LOP to date. Project team will work with Program Management leadership on how information is reported and follow Program Management's direction for any changes on how LOP is reported.	
October 2021 #2 Contract C1136 MOD-00020 Division 20 Portal Widening and Turnback Project Additional Scope and Additional Requirements for the Division 20 Portal Widening and Turnback Project	The OIG recommends: 1. When Metro needs to expedite a project, include Operations in the initial planning phase early, prior to and during design so they can provide constant input during the design. 2. Explore with Operations if they need additional resources to dedicate full time to assist in the intense design, planning, and implementation pre-opening phases of Metro's rail infrastructure/capital projects, or other ways in which Program Management and Operations can work together to approach these projects to maximize cooperation, communication, and assistance. 3. Have the Legal Department review our designer contracts to determine if they are adequate to hold contractors accountable, enforceable, and require use of bonds and proof of adequate insurance to cover errors of this type and resulting in cost of this magnitude.	1. Project alignments were revised during planning phase to accommodate additional storage capacity and technical requirements required for turnback headways. As design progressed, Operations participated in frequent design review meetings. 2. Additional Operations resources during design phases would be beneficial and help produce more comprehensive reviews. 3. Project team is coordinating with County Counsel on review of designer contracts.	
October 2021 #3 Contract C1045 MOD-0 137 Purple Line Extension Sect. 1 Increased Well Maintenance at Western Shaft due to Groundwater Chemistry Impacts	see #4 for recommendation		
October 2021 #4 Contract C1045 MOD-00138 Purple Line Extension Sect. 1 Additional Dewatering Treatment and Discharge Impacts at Western	The OIG recommends that all dewatering change orders for this project should be evaluated or audited. The Geotechnical Baseline Report issued by the consultant to Metro was not accurate for the soil type, ground water, and hydrogen sulfide levels for each segment of Purple Line Section 1 and the consultant might be held liable for some of the costs of differing site conditions not correctly determined by the consultant. Unplanned dewatering site conditions also cost Metro \$15.8 mil. at the La Brea Station and \$16.8 mil. at the La Cienega Station in 2020 and 2019 respectively.	The dewatering MODs for WPLE-1 have been already been evaluated as part of the CN process. In order to minimize the potential for future DSCs on other Projects, consideration should be undertaken to expend more resources during Preliminary Engineering (PE) to more accurately project the actual conditions encountered. The costs of additional PE should be weighed against the increased base bid prices, or future Change Order costs if no additional PE efforts are undertaken. Valid additional costs to Metro, via the base bid or Change Order, will be incurred either way. It is premature at this time to hold the PE Consultant liable for all or a portion of the costs of this MOD.	

ATTACHMENT B (July 2021)

OIG REPORT/ SPOT CHECK # MOD #	RECOMMENDATIONS	MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSES	COMPLETION DATE
July 2021 #1 Contract C0980 MOD-00196 Regional Connector - Transit Corridor Project Construct the 2nd & Broadway Station Overbuild Load Transfer System	none		
July 2021 #2 Contract C0980 MOD-00202 Regional Connector - Transit Corridor Project Revise Communications Radio System Scope of Work- Construction	The OIG recommends that after installation of the new radio system that interface with Los Angeles fire, police and sheriff departments be tested and verified for their signal strength and connectivity.	Agreed, all radio systems will be fully tested and verified for signal strength and connectivity	
July 2021 #3 Contract C1045 MOD-0131 Purple Line Extension Sect. 1 Wilshire/Fairfax Station Subgrade Differing Site Conditions	The OIG recommends that after a DRB issues its recommendations that favor the contractor, Metro act swiftly to move forward with a change notice to the contractor and not delay payment to the contractor, less any credits owed to Metro. We understand in this particular case the contractor assigned a lower priority for processing this change notice over many others.	In this case there was no requirement for Metro to issue a Change Notice due to the DRB ruling. The Contractor (STS) chose to delay providing Metro with a cost proposal associated with the DRB ruling due to other higher Contractor priorities. After the eventual receipt of the DRB ruling proposal from the Contractor, the costs were negotiated, and a MOD issued (w/o any Change Notice being created). It should be noted that whether a Change Notice is issued or not, the Contractor has the right to submit a proposal whenever and for whatever they perceive as changed work (via a Request for Change). Section 1 has and continues to issue Change Notices in a timely manner when Metro recognizes merited changed scope of work.	
July 2021 #4 Contract C1152 MOD-0014 Purple Line Extension Sect. 3 Revisions to Westwood/UCLA Station Entrances – Design Only	none		

Office Of Inspector General Construction Change Order Spot Check Report

Presented By
Karen Gorman
Inspector General

October 2022

Construction Committee

Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority



Spot Checks 1 & 2

File #
2022-0652

1 - **Regional Connector**- - Addl. AT&T Duct bank Installations at 2nd Street – Construction.

Award: **\$4,150,000**

Recommendation:

The OIG recommends, as a **Lesson Learned**, during project planning Metro should ask the Utility company to acknowledgement that all vaults, duct banks, and utility lines conform to current specifications and are in satisfactory condition. It is prudent for Metro to be aware of the utilities condition before entering into a construction contract

2 - **Division 20** - - 1st Street Bridge Continuous Monitoring.

NTE: **\$1,355,238 increase for total of \$3,465,238**

Recommendation:

As was recommended in the prior quarterly construction change orders spot check report, the OIG recommends the issue of liability for sub-contractors claims and bonds be resolved so that it is not necessary to use NTE change order methods, and further change orders follow the standard Metro construction practices and procedures.

October 2022

Construction Committee

Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority



Spot Check 3 & 4

File #
2022-0652

3 - Airport Metro Connector Transit Station - - Bulletin 16 - Light Rail Transit Fence Updates

Award: **\$2,319,894**

Recommendation:

The OIG recommends Metro consider updating Metro Rail Design Criteria (MRDC) and necessary specifications to reflect current 2022 California Seismic standards and future requests for proposals to build better and be prepared for future earthquakes.
This may be considered a **Lesson Learned**.

4 - Purple Line Sect. 1 - - Track Level Access Openings at Wilshire/Western, Wilshire/La Brea and Wilshire/ La Cienega

Award: **\$5,487,903**

Recommendation:

None

Spot Check Schedule Comparison

File #
2022-0652

Schedule Comparison: new delegated process vs. former Board approval process

PROJECT	Title of Change Order	Time Saved Executed date to Board Mtg.	NEW Delegated Process final SOW to Executed date	Former Board Approval Process
REGIONAL CONNECTOR	Additional AT&T Duct bank Installations at 2nd Street – Construction.	25	14	39
DIVISION 20 PORTAL WIDENING & TURNBACK PROJECT	1 st Street Bridge Continuous Monitoring.	22	41	63
AIRPORT METRO CONNECTOR	Bulletin 16 – Light Rail Transit (LRT) Fence Updates	12	43	55
WESTSIDE PURPLE LINE EXT. SECT 1	Track Level Access Openings at Wilshire/Western, Wilshire/La Brea and Wilshire/ La Cienega	39	24	63